

CITY OF PARRAMATTA CURRENT LEGAL CASES & STATUS FOR THE PERIOD OF DECEMBER 2024

Executive Summary

Advice on Council Court proceedings for the period of 1 December 2024 – 31 December 2024 inclusive, is contained in this report.

14

CURRENT LEGAL MATTERS STATISTICS - DECEMBER 2024

LAND AND ENVIRONMENT COURT

Class 1 Appeals

Class 4 Appeals	2
OCAL COURT	
Council Prosecutions	10
DISTRICT COURT	
District Court Appeal	0
NCAT	
Administrative Appeal	2
SUPREME COURT	
Supreme Court Proceedings	2
FEDERAL CIRCUIT COURT	
Federal Circuit Court Appeal	0
Class 1 Appeals	6
LAND AND ENVIRONMENT COURT	
Class 4 Appeals	1
LOCAL COURT	
Council Prosecutions	4
DISTRICT COURT	
District Court Appeal	0
NCAT	
Administrative Appeal	0
SUPREME COURT	
Supreme Court Proceedings	
	0
FEDERAL CIRCUIT COURT	0
Federal Circuit Court Appeal	0

ENVIRONMENT COURT PROCEEDINGProperty Address	Description: Appeal against the refusal of Development Application No. DA/742/2023 seeking approval for food and drink	Status: Appeal listed for s34 conciliation conference on 29 April 2025
63 Wigram Street, Harris Park	premises with associated signage including outdoor dining to operate from 11am to 12 midnight, Monday to Sunday	
- Analicant	Issues: Permissibility/Heritage	Solicitors: Marsdens
• Applicant: Anandsinh Jhala t/as 9 Flavours	issues. Fermissibility/Heritage	External experts:
Alianusiiiii Jilala (7as 5 i lavours		Planner
• Proceedings No.:		Heritage
00329199/2024		
00323133/2024		Internal experts: Nil
EXISTING MATTER		
• Property Address	Description: Appeal against the refusal of Development Application No. DA/655/2023 for the Torrens title subdivision of the land	Status: Appeal is listed for a s34AA Conciliation Conference and Hearing
35 Surrey Street, Epping	into two lots and D associated civil works,	February 2025
Applicant:	Issues: Owners consent, stormwater management, residential subdivision	Solicitors: In-house
Sam Patrick Calleija		
		External experts: Nil
Proceedings No.:		
00329199/2024		Internal experts:
		Planner
 EXISTING MATTER		Engineer
 Property Address 183 Macquarie Street, Parramatta 	Description: Appeal against the PLPP refusal of DA/837/2022 seeking approval for the construction of a 12-storey mixed use building containing ground floor retail/commercial space and 76 Co-Living rooms over one level of basement storage	Status: Appeal listed for hearing on 8 May 2025
		Solicitors: In-house
Applicant:	Issues: Site Suitability, Public Domain, Transport for NSW concurrence, site isolation, Amenity, Built Form and Accessibility	
Rapisarda Trust Pty Ltd		External experts: Nil
• Proceedings No.:		Internal experts:
142854/2024		Planner
		Urban Designer
EXISTING MATTER		Accessibility Officer
Property Address	Description: Appeal against the PLPP's deemed refusal of DA/317/2024 seeking approval for the Demolition, tree removal and	Status: Appeal listed for s34 conciliation conference on
74 Keeler Street Carlingford	construction of a five storey Co-Living Housing development comprising 43 rooms over basement parking.	3 February 2025
• Applicant:	Issues: Objectives of R4 zone, Maximum Building Height, Builk & Scale, Design & Character, Stormwater Management,	Solicitors: In-house
Zeng	Earthworks, Biodiversity, Accessibility, Waste and Site Consolidation	John Colors In Thouse
Zeng	Editivoria, Biodiversity, Accessistinty, Waste and Site Consolidation	External experts: Nil
• Proceedings No.:		
281070/2024		Internal experts:
		Planner
EXISTING MATTER		Landscape Officer
		Urban Designer
		Biodiversity Officer
		Accessibility Officer
		Development Engineer
Property Address	Description: Appeal against the deemed refusal of DA/324/2024 seeking approval for the Demolition, tree removal and	Status: Appeal is listed for s34 conciliation conference on 21 January 20
36 Keeler Street, Carlingford	construction of a 5-storey Co-Living Housing development comprising 44 rooms over basement parking.	
		Solicitors: In-house
• Applicant: Legend Australian Pty Ltd	Issues: Housing SEPP, Height, Flooding, Water Management/Stormwater, Built Form, Amenity, Accessibility, ESD,	External experts: Nil
		lateral consists
• Proceedings No.:		Internal experts:
281104/2024		Planner
EVICTING NACTTED		Landscape Officer
EXISTING MATTER		Accessibility Officer
		Engineer
		Engineer Urban Design

6.	• Property Address 212 Windsor Road, Winston Hills	Description: Appeal against the refusal of DAR/4/2024 in relation to the refusal of a Section 8.3 Review of the Determination of DA/1006/2022 for a Staged development comprising of Stage 1: Tree removal, boundary adjustment, retention of the existing dwelling and Torrens title subdivision into 2 lots; and Stage 2: Construction of a single storey attached dual occupancy	Status: s34AA Conciliation conference and hearing on 1 April 2025 Solicitors: In-house
	Applicant:	development with Torrens title subdivision.	Solicitors: In-nouse
	Urban Link Architects Pty Ltd	Issues: Owners consent for easement/Lapsing of Appeal rights	External experts: Nil
	• Proceedings No.:	Sources Consent for cusement, Eupsing Of Appearing its	Internal experts:
	316284/24		Planner Engineer
	EXISTING MATTER		Liigineer
7.	Property Address	Description: Appeal against the deemed refusal of DA/183/2024 seeking approval for the construction of a mixed-use building	Status: Matter listed for Online Court on 31 January 2025
	23-27 Dixon Street, Parramatta	comprising of commercial tenancies, hotel accommodation, a 125-place childcare facility and basement carpark with 84 car parking spaces across two (2) basement levels	Solicitors: Sparke Helmore Lawyers
	Applicant:	parking spaces do out (2) sasement levels	
	Z Boys Pty Ltd	Issues: Bulk & Scale, overshadowing, non-compliant indoor and outdoor play space, accessibility, flooding, stormwater, landscaping	External experts: Nil
	Proceedings No.:		Internal experts:
	229702/24		Planner Landscape Officer
			Accessibility Officer
	EXISTING MATTER		Catchment & Development Engineer
8.	Property Address: 99 Parramatta Road, Granville	Description: Appeal against the deemed refusal of DA/238/2024 seeking approval for the demolition of all existing structures	Status: Appeal listed for hearing on 24 and 25 March 2025.
	·	across three allotments, tree removal and construction of a three-storey, one hundred and twenty (120) place childcare centre with basement carparking and associated landscaping, and amalgamation of three lots	Solicitors: Sparke Helmore Lawyers
	Applicant: Granville 101 Pty Ltd	Issues: Objectives of the Site, non-compliant, design principles for Child Cares, Urban Design, Landscape and Deep Soil, Public	External experts: N/A
	,	Domain, Water NSW.	
	Proceedings No.:		Internal experts: Planner Landscape Officer
	218377/2024		Accessibility Officer
	EXISTING MATTER		Catchment & Development Engineer
	EXISTING WATTER		
9.	Property Address:	Description: Appeal against the SCCPP deemed refusal of DA/222/2024 seeking approval of a Staged Development comprising	Status: s34 Conciliation Conference adjourned for Online Court on 20 January 2025
	15A-15B Moseley Street and 25- 31 Donald Street, Carlingford	Stage 1 - Demolition of existing buildings, tree removal and construction of a part 4/part 7 storey residential flat building comprising 46 units and a shared basement carpark; Stage 2 - construction of a 6- storey mixed use development comprising an	
	Applicant:	80 place centre based child care centre and 45 residential units. A total of 22 residential units will be allocated for affordable housing in accordance with the requirements of the State Environmental Planning Policy (Housing) 2021.	Solicitors: In-house
	Captag Investments Pty Ltd ATF	Issues: TBA	External experts: N/A
	Captag Investments Trust		Internal experts:
	Proceedings No.:		Planner
	238881/2024		
	EXISTING MATTER		
10.	Property Address: 132 Victoria	Description: Appeal against the refusal of DA/210/2023 for demolition and construction of a 7- storey mixed use development to	Status: Appeal is Part-Heard. Matter listed for hearing on 27 February 2025
	Road, Rydalmere	be comprised of 3 retail tenancies and 45 residential apartments, including affordable apartments, over 3 levels of basement parking. The application is made pursuant to the State Environmental Planning Policy (Housing) 2021. The development is	Solicitors: In-house
	Applicant:	Nominated Integrated pursuant to the Water Management Act 2000.	
	J S Architects Pty Ltd		External experts:
	a Bus as a disc. At	Issues: Height/FSR/Design Quality/landscaping/ ground water/geotechnical impacts of excavation	Hydraulic and geotechnical engineering - Dr Daniel Martens
	• Proceedings No.: 200193/2023		Internal experts: Planner Landscape officer
	200173/2023		Urban designer
	EXISTING MATTER		
11.	Property Address:	Description: Appeal against the deemed delegated refusal of DA/330/2023 for demolition of the existing dwelling, tree removal	Status: Appeal is listed for hearing on
	135 Victoria Road, North Parramatta	and construction of a two-storey boarding house with basement parking and State Title Subdivision into 10 lots.	25 and 26 March 2025.
	Tarramacca	Issues: Non-Compliance with Housing SEPP, Transport for NSW concurrence, Stormwater	Solicitors: In-house
	Applicant:		
	JS Architects		

	• Proceedings No.: 268375/23 EXISTING MATTER		External Experts: Geotechnical Expert Internal Experts: Planner Development Engineer Traffic Engineer Urban Designer
12.	 Property Address: 15, 29 and Carter Street, Lidcombe Applicant: Australia YMCI Pty Ltd 	Description: Appeal against the imposition of conditions on development consent DA/965/2022 which approved a 3 lot Torrens Title subdivision, bulk earthworks, remediation works, site infrastructure works including construction of a new road, utility services, drainage works and works to create a future public open space. Issues: Validity and modification of conditions	Status: NOM hearing listed for 23 January 2025 Hearing listed for 28 March – 1 April 2025 Solicitors: Holding Redlich External experts:
	• Proceedings No.: 121594/2024 EXISTING MATTER		Internal experts: Planner Civil Engineer
13.	 Property Address: 188 Church Street, Parramatta Applicant: G & J Drivas Pty Ltd and Telado Pty Ltd 	Description: Appeal against the PLPP refusal of DA/960/2022 seeking approval for stage 1 concept proposal for six-storey cantilevered commercial extension atop the existing heritage listed, Murray's building, future part demolition of the Heritage item including internal realignment, amendments to the shop fronts, and part removal of the roof. Issues: Heritage/FSR/Flood/Bulk and Scale	Status: Hearing on 12-14 November 2024 – Decision reserved Solicitors: Marsdens Law Group External Experts: Vanessa Holtham - Heritage Consultant Stephen Collier – Urban Design
	• Proceedings No.: 00455119/2023 EXISTING MATTER		Consultant Internal Experts: Planner Catchment Engineer Landscape Officer
14.	 Property Address: 38 Silverwater Road, Silverwater Applicant: CK Design Proceedings No.: 0006681/2024 EXISTING MATTER 	Description: Appeal against the SCCPP's Refusal of DA/737/2022 seeking consent for the demolition of existing structures and the construction of a mixed-use development comprised of retail premises, business/office premise, neighborhood shops, a pub and a childcare centre, over two levels of basement parking. Issues: Height/FSR/contamination/air quality/site suitability for childcare guidelines	= -

LAND A	LAND AND ENVIRONMENT COURT PROCEEDINGS – Class 4 Appeals				
1.	• Property Address:	Description: Appeal seeks a declaration from the Court that development was carried out on land in contravention of	Status: Directions hearing on 7 February 2025		
	40 Greens Avenue, Oatlands	development consent DA/563/2018.			
			Solicitors: Sparke Helmore Lawyers		
	Respondent:	Issues: Development not carried out in line with development consent			
	Abi-Khattar		External experts:		
			Nil		
	• Proceedings No.				
	244872/24		Internal experts:		
	2440/2/24		ТВА		
	EXISTING MATTER				

2.	Property Address:	Description: Failure to comply with removal order	Status: Matter listed for directions hearing on 14 February 2024
	4 Rosen Street, Epping	Issues: Removal orders	Solicitors: Sparke Helmore Lawyers
	• Respondent: Craddock		External experts: Nil
	• Proceedings No. 2024/00267318		Internal experts:
	EXISTING MATTER		

L COL			
	Property Address:	Description:	Mention on 3 February 2025
	77 Wigram Street, Harris Park	Penalty Notice – Court Elected	
		Development without development consent – any other case	Solicitors: Sparke Helmore Lawyers
	Defendant: Defendant:		
	SRP Enterprises Pty Ltd		
	EXISTING MATTER		
	Property Address:	Description: Penalty Notice - Court Elected	Status: Matter is listed for mention on 10 January 2025
		Pollute Waters	
	• Defendant:		Solicitors: Sparke Helmore Lawyers
	Beechwood Homes (NSW) Pty		
	Ltd		
	EXISTING MATTER		
	• Property Address:	Description:	Mention on 17 February 2025
3.	30 Donald Street, Carlingford	Penalty Notice – Court Elected	
		Not complying with requirement under Chapter 7	Solicitors: In-house
	• Defendant:		
	BCJ Pty Ltd		
	EXISTING MATTER		
	Property Address:	Description:	Mention on 20 November 2024
	- 110perty Address.	Penalty Notice - Court Elected	Welltion on 20 November 2024
	Defendant:	Stop on/across driveway/any access to/from land	Solicitors: Police Prosecutors
	MJA SYSTEMS PTY LTD		
	EXISTING MATTER		
	• Property Address:	Description:	Mention on 11 February 2025
5.		Penalty Notice - Court Elected Disobey no stopping sign	
	Defendant:		Solicitors: Police Prosecutors
	BROWN, Willie Marion		
	EXISTING MATTER		
	• Property Address:	Description:	Mention on 3 February 2025
5.		Penalty Notice - Court Elected	
	• Defendant:	Obstruct access to ramp/path/passageway	Solicitors: Police Prosecutors
	SAAVEDRA, Andres Ivan		
	Guacte		
	EXISTING MATTER		
	Property Address:	Description:	Mention on 4 November 2024
7.	39 Fallon Street, Rydalmere	Penalty Notice – Court Elected Pollute Waters – Class 1 Officer	Solicitors: In-house
	Defendant:		
	Meadan Homes Australia		
	ivicadan Homes Australia		
	• EXISTING MATTER		

8.	Property Address:	Description:	Mention on 27 February 2025
	29 Eleanore Street, Rosehill	Penalty Notice – Court Elected Development not in accordance with Development Consent	Solicitors: In-house
	Defendant:		
	Li Bo		
	• EXISTING MATTER		
	Property Address:	Description:	Mention on 4 November 2024.
9.	3 Saunders Road, Ermington	Penalty Notice – Court Elected	Solicitors: In-house
		Pollute Waters – Corporation – Class 1	
	Defendant:		
	Meadan Homes		
		Prospects: Good	
	• EXISTING MATTER		
	• Property Address:	Description:	Hearing on 1 April 2025
10.	41 Hughes Avenue, Ermington	Penalty Notice – Court Elected	
		Development not in accordance with development consent - corporation	Solicitors: Sparke Helmore Lawyers
	• Defendant:		
	M Projects Pty Ltd		
	• EXISTING MATTER		

NCM CIN	NSW CIVIL AND ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL (NCAT)			
1.	Property Address: N/A	Description: Appeal of the decision under Public Spaces (Unattended Property) Act 2021	Status: Judgment reserved	
	• Applicant: Franz Boensch		Solicitors: Matthews Folbigg	
	Proceedings No.: NCAT Proceedings 00210974/2024 EXISTING MATTER			
2.	• Property Address: N/A	Description: Application under the Government Information (Public Access) Act 2009 (NSW)	Status: Next hearing date on 12 December 2024	
	• Applicant: Councillor Kellie Darley EXISTING MATTER		Solicitors: Sparke Helmore	

SUPREM	SUPREME COURT				
1.	Property Address:	Description: Judicial review application on valuation of land	Status: Directions hearing on 18 February 2025		
	14-16 Hill Road, Wentworth Point		Solicitors: Allens Linklaters		
	Applicant:		Solicitors. Alichs Ellikiaters		
	City of Parramatta Council				
	• First Defendant:				
	Transport for NSW				
	 Second Defendant Valuer-General of NSW 				
	74.4C. Ceneral 61 11511				
	EXISTING MATTER				

2.	Property Address: N/A	Description: Judicial review application	Status: Notice of Motion hearing on 26 February 2025
	• Applicant: Councillor Kellie Darley		Solicitors: HWL Ebsworth
	• Second Defendant: Phil O'Toole		
	EXISTING MATTER		

FINALISED MATTERS

LAND A	ND ENVIRONMENT COURT PROCEED		
1.	Property Address:54-56 Marshall Road, Telopea	Description: Appeal against the delegated refusal of DA/115/2023, seeks consent for the Construction of a three storey 92 place childcare centre with 23 at grade parking spots.	Status: Decision reserved – Section 34 Conciliation agreement filed with the Court – Appeal upheld
	• Applicant: Martopea P/L	Issues: Height/Bulk & Scale/Design Excellence/Stormwater	Solicitors: In-house
	• Proceedings No.:		External experts: TBA
	170114/2024		Internal experts:
			Planner
	EXISTING MATTER		Civil Engineer Urban Design Officer
2.	Property Address:	Description: Appeal against the imposition of conditions on development consent DAR/2/2024 which approved the	Status: Appeal is listed for Section 34A Conciliation Conference and Hearing on 18 –
	32 Eastwood Avenue, Eastwood	construction of a new front fence driveway and landscaping works.	19 December 2024, Judgment reserved
	Applicant:	Issues: Validity of condition	Solicitors: In-house
	Lee		External experts: TBA
	• Proceedings No.:		Internal experts:
	189730/2024		Planner
	EXISTING MATTER		Heritage
	EXISTING WATTER		
3.	 Property Address: 30 Rickard Street, Carlingford 	Description: Appeal against the deemed refusal of the Applicant's Development Application No. 6/2024 lodged with City of Parramatta Council on 10 January 2024 seeking consent for the demolition of existing buildings, tree removal and	Status: Decision reserved – Section 34 Conciliation agreement filed with the Court
	, ,	construction of a two storey 63 place child-care centre.	Solicitors: In-house
	Applicant:		
	Serobian	Issues: Bulk, Scale and Design, Stormwater, Traffic, Earthworks, Accessibility	External experts: TBA
			Internal experts:
	• Proceedings No.:		Planner
	90500/2024		Development Engineer Traffic
	EXISTING MATTER		Engineer
			Accessibility Officer
4.	• Property Address:	Description: Appeal against the Delegated refusal of DA/961/2022 seeking approval for the demolition of existing childcare	Status: Hearing on 9-10 October 2024 – Appeal dismissed
	21B-23 Barangaroo Road,	centre, tree removal and construction of a new 72 place childcare centre with at grade parking for 18 vehicles, signage and	
	Toongabbie	front fence. The development is Nominated Integrated Development pursuant to the Water Management Act 2000.	Solicitors: Pikes & Verekers
	Applicant:	Issues: Aims of LEP, Zone objectives, Site Suitability and Location, Character, Bulk & Scale, Landscaping, Acoustic and Visual	External experts: Nil
	Pankhurst & Anor	Privacy, Noise and Air Pollution, Flooding, Traffic & Parking, Biodiversity.	Internal experts: Planning Biodiversity Landscape Flood Traffic
	• Proceedings No.: 293029/23		
	EXISTING MATTER		
5.	Property Address:		Status: Section 34 Agreement filed - Judgment Reserved
	31 Moses Way, Winston Hills	dual occupancy with basement, lifts, retaining walls and Torrens Title subdivision into 2 lots.	Solicitors: In-house
	Applicant:	Issues: Geotech/Engineering	Solicitors. III-IIOuse
	Applicant: Moses & Moses		External experts:
			Geotech Engineer
	• Proceedings No.:		Internal experts:
	189730/2024		Planner
	EVICTING A CATTER		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
	EXISTING MATTER		

6.	Property Address:	Description: Appeal against a Development Control Order – Demolition of unlawful internal fit out of garage and restore as	Status: Decision reserved – Section 34 Conciliation agreement filed with the Court
	102 Eastwood Avenue, Epping	a garage.	
		Issues: Unlawful works	Solicitors: In-house
	• Applicant:		External Experts: Internal Experts:
	Pengcheng Xue		Certifier/Planner Compliance Officer Engineer
	• Proceedings No.: 2023/00348034		
	EXISTING MATTER		

LAND A	LAND AND ENVIRONMENT COURT PROCEEDINGS – Class 4 Appeals							
1.	Property Address:	Description: Failure to comply with removal order	Status: Matter listed for directions hearing on 25 November 2024.					
	9 McKay Street, Dundas Valley	Issues: Removal orders	Solicitors: Sparke Helmore Lawyers					
	• Applicant: G & B Annechini		External experts: Nil					
	• Proceedings No. 2024/00254003		Internal experts: TBA					
	EXISTING MATTER							

LOCAL C	OURT		
1.	Property Address: 17 Quarry Road, Dundas Valley Defendant: Discount Building Material Pty Ltd EXISTING MATTER	Description: Penalty Notice – Court Elected Pollute waters	Mention on 11 November 2024 Solicitors: Sparke Helmore Lawyers
2.	 Property Address: 24 Hinkler Place, Ermington Defendant: Krystal Homes Pty Ltd EXISTING MATTER 	Description: Penalty Notice – Court Elected Breach of development consent	Mention on 18 November 2024 Solicitors: Sparke Helmore Lawyers
3.	 Property Address: 17-19 Bridge Street, Rydalmere Defendant: Theo Enterprises Pty Ltd EXISTING MATTER 	Description: Penalty Notice – Court Elected Fail to comply with Development Control Order	Sentencing hearing adjourned to 11 November 2024. Solicitors: Sparke Helmore Lawyers
4.	Property Address:17-19 Bridge Street, Rydalmere Defendant: Denis Enterprises Pty Ltd EXISTING MATTER	Description: Penalty Notice – Court Elected Fail to comply with Development Control Order	Sentencing hearing adjourned to 11 November 2024. Solicitors: Sparke Helmore Lawyers

WIN/LOSS DECEMBER 2024

Land and Environment Court - Class 1 Appeals

Matter Type	Financial Year	Total Cases	Wins	Losses	Comments
In-house	21/22	11	9	2	Three (3) of the Appeals won, were subject to a section 34 conciliated agreement, with amended plans that resolved the issues.
External	21/22	19	13	6	Six (6) of the Appeals won, were subject to a section 34 agreement with amended plans that resolved the issues.
In-house	22/23	11	11	0	Four (4) of the Appeals won, were subject to a section 34 conciliated agreement with amended plans that resolved the issues.
External	22/23	12	11	1	Four (4) of the Appeals won, were subject to a section 34 conciliated agreement with amended plans that resolved the issues.
In-house	23/24	21	14	7	Nine (9) of the appeals won, were subject to s34 agreement with amended documents.
External	23/24	13	9	3	The eight (8) of the appeals won, were subject to s34 agreement with amended documents.
In-house	24/25	14	14	0	Fourteen (14) of the appeals won, were subject to s34 agreement with amended documents.
External	24/25	7	7	0	Of the seven (7) appeals won, two were dismissed and the others were subject to a s34 agreement with amended documents.

Land and Environment Court – Class 4 Appeals

ind and Environment Court – Class 4 Appeals							
Matter Type	Financial	Total Cases	Wins	Losses	Comments		
	Year						
In-house	23/24	0	0	0			
External	23/24	1	1	0			
In-house	24/25	0	0	0			
External	24/25	0	0	0			

<u>Local Court</u>

ocal Court						
Matter Type	Financial Year	Total Cases	Wins	Losses	Comments	
In-house	22/23	10	10	0		
External	22/23	0	0	0		
In-house	23/24	24	13	3		
External	23/24	2	3	0		
In-house	24/25	10	9	1		
External	24/25	6	6	0		